

CITY OF SAN JOSÉ, CALIFORNIA
 Department of Planning, Building and Code Enforcement
 801 North First Street, Room 400
 San José, California 95110-1795

Hearing Date/Agenda Number
 H.L.C. 6/04/03

Item 4.b.

File Number
 HP03-008

Application Type
 Historic Preservation Permit / Hensley Historic District

Council
 4

SNI
 13th Street

Planning Area
 Central

Assessor's Parcel Number(s)
 249-45-001

STAFF REPORT

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Completed by: Sally Notthoff Zarnowitz

Location: Northwest corner of Hensley Street and North Fourth Street (457 N. 4th St.)

Gross Acreage: 0.22

Net Acreage: 0.22

Net Density: n/a

Existing Zoning: R-M Multi-Family Residence

Existing Use: Single-family residential

Proposed Zoning: No change

Proposed Use: Single-family residential

GENERAL PLAN

Completed by: SNZ

Land Use/Transportation Diagram Designation
 Medium Density Residential (8-16 DU/AC)

Project Conformance:
☒ Yes ☐ No
☐ See Analysis and Recommendations

SURROUNDING LAND USES AND ZONING

Completed by: SNZ

North: Residential

R-M Multiple Residence

East: Residential

R-M Multiple Residence

South: Residential

R-M Multiple Residence

West: Residential

R-M Multiple Residence

ENVIRONMENTAL STATUS

Completed by: SNZ

☐ Environmental Impact Report found complete
☐ Negative Declaration circulated on
☐ Negative Declaration adopted on

☒ Exempt
☐ Environmental Review Incomplete

FILE HISTORY

Completed by: SNZ

Annexation Title: Original City

Date: 3/27/1850

PLANNING DEPARTMENT RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTION

☒ Recommend Approval
☐ Recommend Approval with Conditions
☐ Recommend Denial

Date _____

Approved by: _____

OWNER / DEVELOPER	ARCHITECT	ENGINEER
Naomi and David Dudek 655 S. 6 th St. #3 San Jose CA 95112	Larry Lagier, AIA 1657 McBain Ave. San Jose CA 95125	Steven Duquette 10 S. 3 rd St. San Jose CA 95113

PUBLIC AGENCY COMMENTS RECEIVED	Completed by: SNZ
Department of Public Works	
None	
Other Departments and Agencies	
None	
GENERAL CORRESPONDENCE	
None	
ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	

BACKGROUND

The subject site consists of 0.22 acres on the northwest corner of Hensley Street and North Fourth Street (457 N. Fourth Street). This is a historic structure which was displaced by the Civic Center project. The site is located in the R-M Multi-Family Residential Zoning District with a San José 2020 General Plan Land Use/Transportation Diagram designation of Medium Density Residential (8-16 DU/AC). Existing uses include residential to the north and west, to the south across Hensley St., and to the east across Fourth Street,.

The San Jose Redevelopment Agency applied for a previously approved Site Development permit (H02-009) to allow the conversion of a multi family residence to a single-family residence and a Historic Preservation Permit (HP02-002) for the associated exterior alterations to the residence within the Hensley Historic District. The Site Development Permit included the condition that the applicant would secure permits for and implement the construction of a detached garage. The current owners, Naomi and David Dudek, are requesting a Historic Preservation Permit for minor revisions to the exterior alterations approved under HP02-002, and for the design of the accessory structure.

HISTORIC RESOURCE DESCRIPTION

The structure was evaluated as part of the Environmental Impact Report prepared for the Civic Plaza Redevelopment Area. A brief description of the structure and its historic significance as described in the Civic Plaza EIR follows:

12-16 S. 5th Street: This 1888, Stick Style, two story, rectangular plan, wood frame, hipped roof house has rustic siding on the exterior walls. The projecting front roof eaves have decorative modillion blocks and dentils. The two-square bay window has one over one, wood-sash, double hung windows above inset panels. The house has an angled bay window on the south façade. The projecting hipped roof front entrance porch has two

rounded columns (the center column is missing). The original columns have been removed. The metal porch/stair balustrade and basement-level gate are modern alterations. The corner pilasters on the front façade appear to be an early alteration.

This building is listed as an Identified Structure in the San Jose Historic Resources Inventory and is eligible as a Structure of Merit based on the evaluations done for the Civic Plaza Environmental Impact report. This house has received a number of insensitive later alterations that have diminished its historic integrity. The house is not a distinguished example of Stick Style architecture in San Jose, and it is not associated with persons significant in local history and therefore does not appear to be eligible for the California Register of Historic Places.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Under the provisions of Section 15331 of the State Guidelines for Implementation of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), this project is found to be exempt from environmental review in that the project is limited to the rehabilitation of a historical resource in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring and Reconstructing Historic Buildings (1995), Weeks and Grimmer.

GENERAL PLAN CONFORMANCE

This 0.22 gross-acre site (9,583 SF) is consistent with the site's General Plan Land Use/Transportation Diagram designation of Medium Density Residential (8-16 DU/AC). This density is typified by the minimum 6,000 square foot subdivision lot size which is characteristic of many residential neighborhoods. The historic structure's relocation onto a vacant lot within the Hensley Historic District is also consistent with the General Plan Historic, Archaeological and Cultural Resources Goal of preserving historically significant structures and districts in order to promote a greater sense of awareness and community identity and to enhance the quality of urban living.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Like the previously approved HP Permit, this project proposes to retain and repair existing wood siding, trim and windows, add a compatible addition on the rear of the house, and extend the front porch around to the side of the house. While the previous proposal included lattice on the porch enclosure, the current project includes differentiated wood trim in order to enclose storage space below. The rear addition is slightly larger than the previous proposal and the current proposal includes the addition of basement windows and access. The proposed basement windows will be wood double hung, aligned with existing and proposed windows on the first and second floors. Two (two ft. by three ft.) bathroom windows are proposed to be installed on the sides of the house, and two ornamental fixed wood windows (two ft. by three ft.), which were approved under the previous HP Permit as "Oculus" shaped, are also proposed. The owners have included photographs of similar windows found on houses of the period.

The new wood-framed detached garage with wood siding will be located to the rear, facing the Hensley Street side of the lot. The roofing and siding will match the house, and the doors will be carriage-type garage doors.

ANALYSIS

The primary project issue is conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The project conforms to the Standards in general, and in particular to Standards No.1, No. 6, and No. 9.

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

The property will be returned to its historic use as a single-family detached residence while maintaining its distinctive materials and features.

6. Deteriorated features from the restoration period will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials.

The existing wood siding and double-hung windows will be repaired. Where new wood siding, windows, doors or other features are required, they will match the material, color and dimensions of the old features.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The rear living space and side porch additions will be compatible in scale, size and proportion to the original house. The post design at the side porch will be simplified so that it can be easily differentiated from the distinctive historic front porch posts. The dimension of the siding on the new additions will be differentiated from the original wood siding on the house. Where the first HP Permit indicated a change in the exterior wall plane at the new addition, the current proposal is to use vertical wood trim to delineate the beginning of the new addition. Compatible colors will be presented to at the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting and identified on the final plan set.

COMMUNITY OUTREACH

A public hearing notice for the project was published in a local newspaper and mailed to all property owners and tenants within 500 feet of the subject site.

RECOMMENDATION

Planning staff recommends that the Historic Landmarks Commission find that the proposal conforms to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and recommend approval of the proposed exterior changes to the Director of Planning standard and special conditions as follow:

1. Colors and materials presented to the Historic Landmarks Commission shall be included on the approved plan set.